1 2 3 4 5 6 7	MAKAREM & ASSOCIATES APLC Ronald W. Makarem, Esq. (SB#180442) Samuel D. Almon (SB# 243569) 11601 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2440 Los Angeles, California 90025-1760 Phone: (310) 312-0299; Fax: (310) 312-0296  Attorneys for Plaintiffs RENEE PORTER and JOSHUA TOLIN, FRANK J. FODERA, JR., MICHAEL M BONELLA, and GENEVIEVE BILLSON	ALAMEDA COUNTY  MAR 0 9 2023  CLERK OFFICE SUPERIOR OF
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF	THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	FOR THE COU	JNTY OF ALAMEDA
	v	
11   12	RENEE PORTER and JOSHUA TOLIN,	CASE NO.: RG19009052
13	individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,	Hon. Paul D. Herbert
14	Plaintiffs,	Dept. 302 [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING MOTION
15	EQUINOX HOLDINGS, INC., a Delaware	FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT
16	corporation; and DOES 1-50, inclusive,	[Filed concurrently with Notice of Motion and
17	Defendants.	Motion; Memorandum of Points and Authorities; Declarations of Samuel D. Almon and Julie Green
18		Date: February 28, 2023
19		Time: 3:00 p.m. Dept.: 302
20		Reservation No. A-19009052-015
21	///	
22	///	
23	///	
24   25	111	
26	111	
27	///	
28	///	
STORY.		

DH

Plaintiffs filed a Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement, memorialized in the Stipulation of Class and Representative Action Settlement and Release, (the "Settlement Agreement"), Exhibit 1 to the Declaration of Samuel D. Almon, filed on or about February 3, 2022.

After reviewing the Agreement, the Notice process, and other related documents, and having heard the argument of Counsel for respective parties, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. The Court preliminarily finds that the terms of the proposed class action Settlement are fair, reasonable, and adequate, pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure § 382. In granting preliminary approval of the class action settlement the Court has considered the factors identified in *Dunk v. Ford Motor Co.*, 48 Cal. App. 4th 1794 (1996), as approved in *Wershba v. Apple Computer, Inc.*, 91 Cal. App. 4th 224 (2001) and *In re Mircrosoft IV Cases*, 135 Cal. App. 4th 706 (2006).
- 2. The Court finds that the Settlement has been reached as a result of intensive, serious and non-collusive arms-length negotiations. The Court further finds that the parties have conducted thorough investigation and research, and the attorneys for the parties are able to reasonably evaluate their respective positions. The Court also finds that settlement at this time will avoid additional substantial costs, as well as avoid the delay and risks that would be presented by the further prosecution of the action. The Court finds that the risks of further prosecution are substantial.
- 3. The Court has made no findings on the merits of the claims asserted in the above entitled Action ("Action"). Defendant has denied the allegations asserted in the Action and expressly has made no admission of liability in connection with any of the claims or allegations asserted in the Action.
- 4. The parties' Settlement is granted preliminary approval as it meets the criteria for preliminary settlement approval. The Settlement falls within the range of reasonableness and appears to be presumptively valid, subject only to any objections that may be raised at the final fairness hearing. The Settlement Class meets the requirements for conditional certification for settlement purposes only under Code of Civil Procedure § 382. The Court finds that it is appropriate to notify the members of the proposed settlement Class of the terms of the proposed settlement.
- 5. The Court finds further that, in the present case, the proposed method of providing notice of the Settlement to the Settlement Class via First Class U.S. Mail to each Settlement Class Member's last known address, is reasonably calculated to notify the Settlement Class Members of the proposed

Settlement and provides the best notice possible under the circumstances. The Court also finds the Notice of Class Action Settlement form is sufficient to inform the Settlement Class Members of the terms of the Settlement and their rights thereunder, including the right to object to the Settlement or any part thereof and the procedure for doing so, their right to exclude themselves from the Settlement and the procedure for doing so, their right to obtain a portion of the Settlement proceeds, and the date, time and location of the Final Approval Hearing. The proposed Notice of Class Action Settlement, Exhibit A to the Settlement Agreement, and the procedure for providing Notice set forth in the Settlement Agreement, are approved by the Court.

- 6. For purposes of settlement only, the Court provisionally and conditionally certifies the following class: "All persons employed by Equinox Holdings, Inc. ("Equinox") in California as a non-exempt, hourly-paid employee at any time from April 3, 2015 through December 31, 2022" (the "Settlement Class"; members of the Settlement Class are referred to herein as "Settlement Class Members"). For purposes of approval of the PAGA portion of the proposed settlement, PAGA Members is defined as "all persons employed by Equinox in California as non-exempt employees at any time from December 26, 2017 through December 31, 2022." PAGA Members cannot opt out of or object to the settlement of the PAGA claim.
- 7. Plaintiffs Renee Porter, Joshua Tolin, Frank J. Fodera, Jr., Michael M. Bonella, and Genevieve Billson ("Plaintiffs") are appointed the Class Representatives. The Court finds that Ronald W. Makarem and Samuel D. Almon, and Makarem & Associates, APLC are adequate, as they are experienced in wage and hour class action litigation and have no conflicts of interest with absent Class Members, and that they adequately represented the interests of absent class members in the Litigation. Ronald W. Makarem and Samuel D. Almon, and Makarem & Associates, APLC are appointed Class Counsel.
- 8. Under the terms of the Settlement Agreement, the Court preliminarily approves the Parties' selection of CPT Group, Inc. as the Settlement Administrator. The Settlement Administrator is ordered to mail the Class Notice to the Settlement Class Members via First-Class U.S. Mail as specified in the Settlement Agreement, and to otherwise carry out all other duties set forth in the Settlement Agreement. The Parties are ordered to carry out and comply with all terms of this Order and the

Settlement Agreement, and particularly with respect to providing the Settlement Administrator all information necessary to perform its duties under the Settlement Agreement.

- 9. Class Members will be bound by the Agreement unless they submit a timely and valid written request to be excluded from the Settlement. Any Settlement Class Member who wishes to comment on or object to the Settlement or any term thereof, including any proposed award of attorney's fees and costs to Class Counsel or any proposed representative enhancement to the Class Representative, shall have forty five (45) days from the mailing of the Class Notice to submit their comments and/or objection to the Settlement Administrator, as set forth in the Settlement Agreement and Class Notice. Settlement Class Members likewise shall have forty five (45) days from the mailing of the Class Notice to submit to the Settlement Administrator any dispute regarding the calculation of their Individual Settlement Share, as set forth in the Settlement and Class Notice. Settlement Class Members likewise shall have forty five (45) days from the mailing of the Class Notice to submit to the Settlement Administrator a Request for Exclusion from the Settlement, as set forth in the Settlement and Class Notice.
- 10. A Final Approval Hearing is hereby set for September, 2023, at 3:00 p.m. in Department 302 of the Alameda County Superior Court, to consider any objections to the Settlement, determine if the proposed Settlement should be found fair, adequate and reasonable and given full and final approval by the Court, and to determine the amount of attorney's fees and costs awarded to Class Counsel, the amount of any representative enhancement award to the Class Representatives, and to approve the fees and costs payable to the Settlement Administrator. All legal memoranda, affidavits, declarations, or other evidence in support of the request for final approval, the award of attorney's fees and costs to Class Counsel, the enhancement award to the Class Representative, and the fees and costs of the Settlement Administrator, shall be filed no later than sixteen (16) court days prior to the Final Approval Hearing. Notice of the Final Approval Hearing shall be provided to the Labor & Workforce Development Agency concurrently with filing the final approval papers. The Court reserves the right to continue the Final Approval Hearing without further notice to the Settlement Class Members.

- 11. Provided the Settlement Class Member has not submitted a timely and valid Request for Exclusion, any Settlement Class Member may appear, personally or through their own counsel, and be heard at the Final Approval Hearing regardless of whether they have submitted a written objection.
- 12. The Court reserves the right to continue the date of the final approval hearing without further notice to Class Members.
- 13. The Court retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or in connection with the settlement.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 03/09/2023

Hon. Paul D. Herbert Judge of the Superior Court

BOX

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA	FILED Superior Court of California County of Alameda 03/10/2023
COURTHOUSE ADDRESS: George E. McDonald Hall of Justice 2233 Shoreline Drive, Alameda, CA 94501	
PLAINTIFF/PETITIONER: Renee Porter et al	By: Deputy
DEFENDANT/RESPONDENT: Equinox Holdings, Inc.	P. Tungohan
CERTIFICATE OF ELECTRONIC SERVICE CODE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE 1010.6	CASE NUMBER: RG19009052

I, the below named Executive Officer/Clerk of Court of the above-entitled court, do hereby certify that I am not a party to the cause herein, and that on this date I served one copy of the Order (\*Order Granting Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement: 03/09/2023) entered herein upon each party or counsel of record in the above entitled action, by electronically serving the document(s) from my place of business, in accordance with standard court practices.

Renee Porter

Equinox Holdings, Inc.

Ronald W. Makarem Makarem & Associates

Mia Farber Jackson Lewis LLP

Samuel David Almon Makarem & Associates almon@law-rm.com

Renee Porter

Joshua Tolin

Equinox Holdings, Inc.

Chad Finke, Executive Officer / Clerk of the Court

By:

Dated: 03/10/2023

P. Tungohan, Deputy Clerk

Orligino Jungohan

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF ALAMEDA	FILED Superior Court of California County of Alameda 03/10/2023 Chad Finke, Executive Officer / Cherk of the Court	
COURTHOUSE ADDRESS: George E. McDonald Hall of Justice 2233 Shoreline Drive, Alameda, CA 94501		
PLAINTIFF/PETITIONER: Renee Porter et al		
DEFENDANT/RESPONDENT: Equinox Holdings, Inc.	P. Tungohan	
CERTIFICATE OF MAILING	CASE NUMBER: RG19009052	

I, the below-named Executive Officer/Clerk of the above-entitled court, do hereby certify that I am not a party to the cause herein, and that on this date I served the Order (\*Order Granting Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement: 03/09/2023) upon each party or counsel named below by placing the document for collection and mailing so as to cause it to be deposited in the United States mail at the courthouse in Alameda, California, one copy of the original filed/entered herein in a separate sealed envelope to each address as shown below with the postage thereon fully prepaid, in accordance with standard court practices.

Mia Farber Jackson Lewis LLP 725 S. Figueroa St., #2500 Los Angeles, CA 90017Ronald W. Makarem Makarem & Associates 11601 Wilshire Blvd Suite 2440 Los Angeles, CA 90025-1760

Samuel David Almon Makarem & Associates 11601 Wilshire Blvd Los Angeles, CA 90025

Dated: 03/10/2023

Chad Finke, Executive Officer / Clerk of the Court

By:

P. Turgohan, Deputy Clerk

Orligino Jungohan



DOCUMENT: Order (\*Order Granting Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement: 03/09/2023) (ORD010)

CASE: RG19009052

SIGNED AND FILED: 03/09/2023

FILED BY:

BARCODE BY: ptungohan 03/10/2023 9:12 AM ENTERED BY: ptungohan 03/10/2023 9:11 AM